Comparative Analysis of Islamiyāt and Translation of Qurān in National Curriculum of Pakistan

Sehrish Nazir
Research Scholar, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi:96sehrish@gmail.com
Dr Shahzadi Pakeeza
Chairperson, Department of Islamic Studies, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi:dr.pakeeza@fjwu.edu.pk

Abstract

The main purpose of this article is to compare and contrast some aspects of Islamiyāt compulsory and Islamiyāt elective with Tarjamat-ul-Qurān, which are being taught at elementary, secondary and higher secondary levels in the curricula of Punjab Pakistan. Document analysis method is applied to accomplish the task. Similarities and differences have been enlisted to understand the content analysis presented by all these textbooks. Moreover, Textbooks of Tarjama-tul-Qurān, Islamiyāt compulsory and Islamiyāt elective have been critically studied to detect their basic theme. Translation given in Tarjamat-ul-Qurān exhibited simplicity which is quite easy to understand for both the students and teachers. The findings revealed that a bulk of information was reflected through Islamiyāt compulsory syllabus while Islamiyāt elective were written in a brief and a concise manner.

Keywords: *Tarjamat-ul-Qurān, Islamiyāt compulsory, Curriculum.*

1. Introduction

The primary source which directly influence and shape the ideological mind set of Pakistani learners is their textbooks. Textbooks hold central position in learning process and serves as a bridge between teachers and students through which the process of getting education could be accomplished. A typical textbook exhibit organized units of information in varying form of text, tables, pictures and assessment exercises. Authors and publishers took the responsibility of formulating textbook by adopting frameworks that how a specified domain of knowledge could be transferred. Besides spreading knowledge, text-books incorporate socio-cultural, political and religious ideologies. Additionally, Textbooks highlight the most-valued skills appreciated by a society.[1]

1.1. Importance of Comparing Textbooks

Based upon different culture financial resources and historical perspective, each country has established its own system of education, which has led to unique curriculum designs and textbooks. Hence, in order to understand the methodologies adopted by each country the comparative analysis of various textbooks play a vital role. Not only it is necessary to understand the educational systems at international but also at national levels. Comparative analysis helps learners to understand the similarities and differences between certain ideas and events. Comparative analysis is a cognitive process which helps to devise the most appropriate content and revision of textbooks. Least attention has been paid on this aspect of textbook's comparative analysis. Comparative analysis helps authors and

[1]Sarwat, Samina, Bushra Bano, Muhammad Imran, Amanullah and Waheed Shahzad. "A Linguistic Analysis Of Religious Content: A Comparation Of Class 10th Textbooks In Punjab And Sindh." Journal of Positive School Psychology (2023): 565-575

publishers to reset their compass. It motivates learners to get better piece of knowledge. It uncovers their effects on learner's achievement. Being an ideological country, the Pakistani curriculum revolves around Islamic beliefs and concepts. During the reign of Zia-ul-Haq, the curriculum was shifted towards Islamization which was later on criticized by some educationists. From time to time, various educational policies were introduced in the country along-with their own particular features. To focus on complete, holistic and positive image of portraying Islam and in order to resolve such type of issues single national curriculum was introduced during year2021.[2]

According to the Act, XIV of 2021**,** teaching of translation of Holy Qurān was made a compulsory separate subject for all the Muslim students living in Punjab Province. Although, they were already getting information about Islam in their textbook of Islamiyāt compulsory and Pak Studies. One of the basic purposes behind the present study is to make a comparison between the content of these two books.

2. Similarities between Islamiyāt Compulsory and *Tarjamt-ul-Qurān*

1. Both types of books were formulated under the "educational reforms of Punjab Government".
2. Punjab curriculum and textbook board, Lahore contains the preserved rights of both the books.
3. The basic knowledge about the last Prophet has been shared in both books.

[2]Huang, Ronghuai, Ahmed Tlili, Xiangling Zhang, Tianyue Sun, Junyu Wang, Ramesh C. Sharma, Saida Affouneh et al. "A Comprehensive Framework for Comparing Textbooks: Insights from the Literature and Experts." Sustainability 14, no. 11 (2022): 6940.

4. Basic Islamic knowledge about beliefs have been shared by both the books.
5. Skills for students have been included in Islamiyāt compulsory to understand the problems relating to faith and religious life. These skills were taken from Tarjamat-ul-Qurān.
6. Both books are reliable in the sense that the text mentioned is easily understandable and students do not need to look for any other book or electronic device.
7. Both books provide a stimulus for learning.
8. Content of both books embody a view of nature of religious learning.
9. Content material has been addressed in a simple, easy and direct National language which student can easily grip.
10. Content material of both books reflect the nature of student learning outcomes (SLO'S).
11. Target learners for both the books are of same age group.
12. Certain Civic, moral, performance and intellectual virtues are shared by both the books.
13. Character building is one of the basic objective behind formulating all the books related to Islamic teachings. This trait is also exhibited by both the books.
14. Both the books have paid attention to teaching the decuple values like peace respect of the elders, cooperation among fellows, honesty, simplicity and patience.
15. A list of student learning outcomes have been shared in the beginning of every lesson which is a similar trait shared by both books.

16. Pattern and division of assessment exercises have similar types of questions in both the books.
17. This is the first edition of both the books.
18. Both of the books are aligned with Sustainable Development Goal(SDG- 4.7).[3]

3. Differences between Islamiyāt Compulsory and *Tarjamt-ul-Qurān*

Following major differences were found in Islamiyāt compulsory and Tarjamat-ul-Qurān-al-Majeed.

Islamiyāt Compulsory	***Tarjamat-ul-Qurān***
By following the objective Resolution in 1949 and 1973 Constitution of Pakistan, the Govt of Pakistan declared it as a compulsory subject in 1978.	Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board (PCTB) held Its 83rd meeting on 23rd May 2021 and declared Tarjamat-ul-Qurān as a separate compulsory subject.
Under SNC, it has been given the status of a separate subject from grade 1st to 12th.	It is for grades 6th to 12th.
It consists of seven units, each unit contains varying number of lessons. Lesson no. one is about Qurān and hadiths, lesson two is about Beliefs and worships, lesson three is about Seerah of Prophet ﷺ, lesson no 4 is about manners and etiquettes, lesson no 5 is about ethics and consuetude, lesson no 6 is about essence of instructions and celebrities of Islam and lesson no 7 is about Islamic teachings and contemporary demands.	It consists of 4 units. Unit 1 talks about brief introduction of Prophet Muhammad and his attributes. 2nd unit discussed about etiquettes of Qurān, while 3rd unit consists of varying number of surahs and last unit is about Prophets. For every grade, different Prophets have been selected which covers well renowned Prophets starting from Adam to Esa.

[3]Svanemyr, Joar, Qadeer Baig, and Venkatraman Chandra-Mouli. "Scaling up of life skills based education in Pakistan: a case study." Sex Education 15, no. 3 (2015): 249-262

Jameel Noori Nastaleeq font has been selected for Urdu composing.	Mohammadi Qurānic, Almushaf fonts have been selected for Arabic composing.
Relatively complex Urdu language is used.	Relatively simple Urdu translation is used.
It highlights the Madni period of Prophet Muhammad ﷺ.	It highlights the Makki period of Prophet Muhammad ﷺ.
It has portrayed the personalities of Companions of the Prophet, scholars, Conqueror's in Islam, children of the Prophet and his wives.	It has portrayed only the personalities of various Prophets like, Adam, Noah, Hud, Saleh, Loot and Shoab.
Its content explains in detail the basic beliefs and worships of Islam.	Its contents revolve around the brief introduction of selected surahs, including their cause of revelation, central idea and simplified translation.
Every lesson is supplemented with relevant Qurānic verses and hadiths.	More than 95% of the content matter is about Qurānic verses while relevant hadith have also been quoted occasionally.
It helps to learn more Urdu vocabulary	It helps to learn more Arabic vocabulary
It helps to develop students' inquiry, communication and writing skills.	It helps to develop students critical thinking along-with their cognitive development
Nature of content is descriptive and explanatory.	Nature of content is exploratory, allusive and inimitable.
Values and attitude appeared in textbook of grade 6: authenticity, fidelity, brotherhood, fraternity, equality, parental and children rights, teachers, neighbor's rights, selflessness, kindness and purity.[4]	**Values and attitude** appeared in textbook of grade 6: gratitude, helping the poor and orphans, humbleness, significance of knowledge, patience and hospitality.[5]
Values and attitude appeared in textbook of grade 7: Equality,	**Values and attitude** appeared in textbook of grade 7: significance

[4]Yasin, H.(2022).” Ethics & Consuetude”. Islamiyat 6th :PCTB. Lahore. 65-73
[5]Gulzar ,(2022)”Selected Surah ”,Tarjmatul Quran Al-Majeed 6th :PCTB,Lahore6-44

moderation in socio-economic life, protection of women's rights, guest and patient's rights ect.[6]	of struggle, importance of Qurān, offering prayers, investigating Universe, organization, paying zakat, avoiding greed, simplicity, bravery, punctuality and contentment.
Values and attitude appeared in textbook of grade 8th: Sense of identity, social justice, kindness, rights of people (widows ,disable, passengers , orphans) forgiveness, national unity and good manners.[7]	**Values and attitude appeared in textbook of grade 8th**: objectivity about life, forgiveness, avoid violence, forbidding suspicion, and backbiting, stubbornness and impudence.[8]

4. Comparative Analysis of Content of *Tarjamat-ul-Qurān* and Islamiyāt Elective (at Secondary and Higher Secondary Levels)

Similarities between Tarjmat-ul-Qurān with Islamiyāt Elective at Secondary and Higher Secondary level

1. Both the books contain enough content regarding etiquettes of recitation of Qurān.
2. Punjab curriculum and textbook board, Lahore contains the preserved rights of both the books.
3. Islamiyāt elective contains twenty verses along with their translation and exegesis. Same verses were found in content of Tarjamat-ul-Qurān.
4. Both of books shared similar holy verses regarding the dignity of Qurān.
5. The efforts of the Prophet Muhammad in the propagation of Allah's message are also a shred content in both the books.

[6]Malik and Bakhsh.(2022)." Ethics and Consuetude". Islamiyat 7th :PTCB, Lahore.80-95
[7]Zaman and Javed.(2022)." Ethics and Consuetude". Islamiyat 8th :PTCB, Lahore.59-65
[8]Afzal, S (2022)"Selected Surah ",Tarjmatul Quran Al-Majeed 8th :PCTB,Lahore46-150

6. The preaching efforts of Prophets (Noah, Ibrahim, Musa and Esa) have been shared in both the books.
7. The basic contents of both the books revolved around belief in Oneness of Allah, Apostleship and life after hereafter.
8. The concept about finality of Prophet (khatam -e Nabuwat) has been touched in both the books.
9. The exercise pattern of both the books exhibit similarity, in terms of short and objective questions.
10. Both the book helps to build up the personality of the student as a global citizen.[9]

4.1. Differences between Tarjmat-ul-Qurān and Islamiyāt Elective at Secondary and Higher Secondary level

Some of the basic differences found between Tarjmat-ul-Qurān and Islamiyāt Elective at Secondary and Higher Secondary level are given below.

Tarjamat-ul-Qurān	**Islamiyāt Elective**
Tarjamat-ul-Qurān has been made compulsory since 2021.	Islamiyāt Elective has been included in the curriculum of Punjab after 1969 educational policy. But the books taken under study were published during session 2018-19.
Tarjamat-ul-Qurān has been made compulsory from 6^{th} to 12^{th} classes.	Islamiyāt elective is an optional subject from secondary level up-to PHD level according to student own choice.
Tarjamat-ul-Qurān discusses the Makki part of life span of the prophet Muhammad in more detail.	It brought into light both periods of Prophet Muhammad life whether spent in Makkah or Madina.

[9] Al-Azhari et al.(1976) Islamiyat Elective 9-10^{th} : PTCB, Lahore, 7-117

Prophet Muhammad childhood life has not been mentioned in Tarjamat-ul-Qurān.	At secondary level this book has explained the life of Prophet Muhammad at his childhood.
Through critical thinking students have to deduce the *mazameen -e -Qurān*.	The *mazameen -e -Qurān(*subject matter of Qurān) have been enlisted in elective book.
Tarjmat-ul-Qurān consists of 7 units.	1st year Islamiyāt elective book consists of two sections.
Every unit contains variety of lesson but Tarjamat-ul-Qurān does not address about Islamic culture and civilization.	First section consists of six chapters. Chapter one contains two lessons about Islamic culture and civilization.
Personal and Individualized life has not been separately discussed under one heading.	Chapter number two discusses Personal and Individualized life.
Family system and social life were not discussed as a separate chapter in this book.	Chapter number three revolves around social life and family system.
Islamic educational system was not mentioned in it separately ,students have to explore it.	Chapter number four elaborates the educational system of Islam.
Muslim world which exhibits entire Muslim culture was not touched under same topic in this book.	Chapter number six talks about Muslim world. It also discusses muslim culture in detail.
Seerah of Prophet Muhammad was not discussed separately in Tarjmat ul Qurān.[10]	Islamiyāt elective consists of two portion in composed of twenty four lessons chapter one is very lengthy and covers the different aspect of Seerah of Prophet in a comprehensive way
Moral values have been highlighted.	Civic and intellectual values have been focused.[11]

5. Conclusion

It is found that **Islamiyāt elective content** provides too much knowledge regarding islamic culture and civilization. Islamiyāt elective is

[10]Tahir. M(2022)"selected surah" Tarjmatul Quran Al-Majeed 11th :PCTB, Lahore 6-119

[11]Hashmi et all,(2018-2019) Islamiyat Elective, PTCB, Lahore 20-72

logically a continuation of Islamiyāt compulsory. It has been designed and formulated for those students who want to study it as an optional subject and specialize Islamiyāt at bachelor level thus, its content is more comprehensive and descriptive than Islamiyāt compulsory. Moreover, it has been designed for secondary and higher secondary levels therefore, its content should also depict higher level of learning. Students not only have a complete grip over their basic Islamic ideology but they also have in depth knowledge about islamic culture and civilization in order to maintain their true muslim identity. The students would have knowledge to cope the emerging challenges across the world. For this reason, they should have knowledge about religion as well. Although the knowledge in terms of islamic identity is enough but general information about other religions are missing in these textbooks ranging up-to higher secondary level. Only holy verses depict the behavior of Christians, Jewish and non-believer. Moreover, concept about Comparison of Religions is not found in Islamiyāt elective.Since 1978, **Islamiyāt compulsory** has been the part of Punjab curriculum. This subject has been revised time to time according to the National Polices of Pakistan. The subject theme of it had been revolving around the basic Islamic beliefs, moral values, Islamic norms and Islamic identity explaining certain selected verses and hadiths relevant to particular subject matter. Despite of all efforts done in the revision of Islamiyāt Compulsory Pakistani society did not emerge as true Muslim society. Flaws and deficiency were observed not only in society but also in the character and personalities of muslim youth. Different types of crime ratios enhanced alarmingly during the past decades. Muslim Youth was found inefficient to cope the emerging challenges of the new world order and particularly to defend their own religion. In order to revise the muslim

identity and develop the holistic personality of Pakistani youth who could portrays the true face of Islam as a peace of religion, the Punjab Government has inculcated this new subject under the name of Tarjamtul Qurān-al-Majeed in the curriculum of grade VI-XII.

The book has been simply designed by the same authors and publishers who have done work on Islamiyāt compulsory. More than 90% of this book covers the selected surah of Qurān for every grade. When studied carefully the content matter of both the Islamiyāt compulsory and ***Tarjamat-ul-Qurān*** it was found that both the books are complementary to each other. Though, certain differences are also found, but both have their own importance in building up students' personalities. Regarding the perception of students, it was found after survey that they perceived Tarjamat-ul-Qurān with more enthusiasm and love. According to their point of view, they considered it more straight forward, clear in content matter and easy to understand as compared to islamic books. In terms of their likings, they reported that their interest has been enhanced in their religion after reading this new book. As Qurān is sacred text and has superiority above all the texts of the world literature, the comparison of Qurānic text with any other book is unimaginable. The comparative analysis done in this section is only an attempt to explore the similarities and differences found in the textbooks of Punjab curriculum. One of the major reason behind the student's warm perception regarding Tarjamat-ul-Qurān lies in the fact that through studying the translation of verses directly have influenced their minds and clear their concepts which were present in Islamiyāt.



This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License